

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TYLER DIVISION**

PATENT HARBOR, LLC

Plaintiff,

v.

DELL INCORPORATED

Defendant.

§
§
§
§
§
§
§
§

CIVIL ACTION NO. _____

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

ORIGINAL COMPLAINT

This is an action for patent infringement in which Patent Harbor, LLC, (“Patent Harbor”) makes the following allegations against Dell Incorporated (“Defendant” or “Dell”).

PARTIES

1. Patent Harbor is a corporation organized under the laws of the State of Texas. Patent Harbor maintains its principal place of business at 4455 Camp Bowie Blvd., Suite 114, Fort Worth, Texas 76107.

2. Upon information and belief, Defendant Dell Incorporated is, and at all relevant times mentioned herein was, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with a principal place of business at One Dell Way, Round Rock, Texas 78682. Dell manufactures for sale and/or sells computers to consumers in the United States and, more particularly, in the Eastern District of Texas. Dell may be served with process by serving its registered agent, Corporation Service Company, located at 82711 Centerville Rd, Suite 400, Wilmington, DE 19808.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

3. This is an action for violation of the patent laws of the United States, Title 35,

United States Code, more particularly, 35 U.S.C. §§ 271 *et seq.*

4. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1338(a).

5. This Court has personal jurisdiction over the Defendant. Defendant has conducted and does conduct business within the State of Texas. Defendant, directly or through intermediaries (including distributors, retailers, and others), ships, distributes, offers for sale, sells, and advertises (including the provision of an interactive web page) its products in the United States, the State of Texas, and the Eastern District of Texas. Upon information and belief, each Defendant has purposefully and voluntarily placed one or more of its infringing products, as described below, into the stream of commerce with the expectation that they will be purchased by consumers in the Eastern District of Texas. Upon information and belief, these infringing products have been and continue to be purchased by consumers in the Eastern District of Texas. Defendant has committed the tort of patent infringement within the State of Texas and, more particularly, within the Eastern District of Texas.

6. This Court has managed multiple cases related to the patent-in-suit through final claim construction, and, with respect to Civil Action No. 6:10-cv-361-LED-JDL, up through jury trial, which concluded with a verdict finding validity and infringement of the patent-in-suit on December 17, 2012.

7. Venue is proper in the Eastern District of Texas under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391 and 1400(b).

COUNT 1: INFRINGEMENT OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,684,514

8. Patent Harbor refers to and incorporates all preceding paragraphs as though fully set forth herein.

9. United States Patent No. 5,684,514 (“the ‘514 Patent”), entitled “Apparatus and

Method for Assembling Content Addressable Video” was duly and legally issued by the United States Patent and Trademark Office on November 4, 1997, after full and fair examination. Patent Harbor is the assignee of all rights, title, and interest in and to the ‘514 Patent and possesses all rights of recovery under the ‘514 Patent, including the right to recover damages for past infringements. A true and correct copy of the ‘514 Patent is attached as Exhibit A.

10. Upon information and belief, Dell manufactures, uses, sells, offers to sell and/or distributes computers, including, but not limited to, the XPS 14z (L412z) laptop, which is bundled with the Roxio Creator Starter DVD/BD Authoring Software. DVD/BD Authoring Software is software that allows a user of the computer to take pre-recorded video and create a title or chapter list (similar to the scene selection menu provided on a commercial DVD/BD disc), where the title or chapter menu has a description (pictorial or written) of the video that will be accessed if the viewing user selects a particular title or chapter from the scene selection menu. The Dell computers, with their bundled DVD/BD Authoring Software, and all other Dell computers bundled with DVD/BD Authoring Software having comparable functionality to the aforementioned Roxio Creator Starter DVD/BD Authoring Software infringe claim 1 of the ‘514 Patent. Claim 1 has been construed by the Court as set forth in Exhibit B.

11. Dell has actual notice of the ‘514 Patent at least as early as the filing of this Original Complaint.

12. Upon information and belief, Dell is infringing claim 1 of the ‘514 Patent under 35 U.S.C. § 271 by performing, without authority, one or more of the following acts: making, using, importing, offering to sell, and selling within the United States the patented invention of one or more claims of the ‘514 Patent.

13. Patent Harbor has been damaged as a result of Dell’s infringing conduct. Dell is,

thus, liable to Patent Harbor in an amount that adequately compensates Patent Harbor for their infringement, which, by law, cannot be less than a reasonable royalty, together with interest and costs as fixed by this Court under 35 § U.S.C. 284.

14. Patent Harbor is in compliance with the requirements of 35 U.S.C. § 287, and is entitled to past damages. From the date of six years before this suit was filed up to April 4, 2008, there were no authorized sales of commercial products embodying the claims of the ‘514 Patent. As of April 4, 2008, there was a licensee, but that licensee had an obligation to mark. As of May 3, 2011, Patent Harbor entered into a license with a third party that sold DVD Recorders that Patent Harbor accused of infringing claim 1 of the ‘514 Patent, and that license did not contain an obligation to mark accused products with the ‘514 Patent number.

15. As a result of Dell’s acts of infringement, Patent Harbor has suffered and will continue to suffer damages in an amount to be proved at trial.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Patent Harbor prays for the following relief:

- A. A judgment that Dell has directly infringed the ‘514 Patent as alleged herein;
- B. A judgment and order requiring Dell to pay Patent Harbor compensatory damages in an amount no less than a reasonable royalty under 35 U.S.C. § 284.
- C. A judgment and order requiring Dell to pay Patent Harbor pre-judgment and post-judgment interest on the damages awarded;
- D. A judgment and order that Dell pay Patent Harbor an on-going royalty for future acts of infringement if appropriate, at a rate determined by the jury or the Court; and
- E. Any and all other relief as the Court deems just and equitable.

DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL

Patent Harbor, LLC hereby demands that all issues be determined by a jury.

DATED: January 28, 2013

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Keith A. Rutherford

Keith A. Rutherford
Texas State Bar No. 17452000
John C. Cain
Texas State Bar No. 00783778
Scott Reese
Texas State Bar No. 24046696
Daniel R. Peterson
Texas State Bar No. 24065899
WONG, CABELLO, LUTSCH,
RUTHERFORD & BRUCCULERI, L.L.P.
20333 SH 249, Ste. 600
Houston, Texas 77070
Telephone: (832) 446-2400
Facsimile: (832) 446-2424
E-Mail: krutherford@counselip.com
E-Mail: jcain@counselip.com
E-Mail: sreese@counselip.com
E-Mail: dpeterson@counselip.com

Eric Miller Albritton
Texas State Bar No. 00790215
Stephen E. Edwards
Texas State Bar No. 00784008
Michael A. Benefield
Texas State Bar No. 24073408
Debra Coleman
Texas State Bar No. 24059595
ALBRITTON LAW FIRM
PO Box 2649
Longview, Texas 75606
Telephone: (903) 757-8449
Facsimile: (903) 758-7397
E-Mail: ema@emafirm.com
E-Mail: see@emafirm.com
E-Mail: mab@emafirm.com
E-Mail: drc@emafirm.com

T. John Ward, Jr.
Texas State Bar No. 00794818
WARD & SMITH LAW FIRM
1127 Judson Road, Suite 220
Longview, Texas 75601
Telephone: (903) 757-6400
Facsimile: (903) 757-2323
E-Mail: jw@jwfirm.com

**COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF
PATENT HARBOR, LLC**